Geodetic measurement of horizontal strain across the Red River fault near Thac Ba, Vietnam, 1963–1994

Duong Chi Cong¹, K. L. Feigl²

¹ Institute of Geology, National Center for Natural Science and Technology, Nghia Do, Cau Giay, Ha Noi, Vietnam
e-mail: dccong@hotmail.com; Tel.: +84 4 8343 068; Fax: +84 4 8362 886
² UMR 5562, Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique, 14 av. Edouard Belin, 31400 Toulouse, France
e-mail: kurt.feigl@cnrs.fr; Tel.: +33 5 61 33 29 40; Fax: +33 5 61 33 29 00

Received: 18 November 1997 / Accepted: 28 January 1999

Abstract. Geodetic measurements from 1963 through 1994 are used to estimate horizontal strain rates across the Red River fault near Thac Ba, Vietnam. Whether or not this fault system is currently active is a subject of some debate. By combining: (1) triangulation from 1963, (2) triangulation in 1983, and (3) Global Positioning System (GPS) observations in 1994, horizontal shear strain rates are estimated without imposing any prior information on fixed stations. The estimated rates of shear strain in ten triangular subnetworks surrounding the fault trace are not significantly different from zero at 95% confidence. The maximum rate of dextral shear is less than 0.3 ± 0.1 μrad/year in all but one of the triangles. The estimates help bound the slip rate in a simple elastic dislocation model for a locked, vertical strike-slip fault. By assuming a locking depth of 5–20 km, the most likely values for the deep slip rate are between 1 and 5 mm/year of right-lateral motion. These values delimit the 23% confidence interval. At 95% confidence, the slip rate estimate falls between 7 mm/year of left-lateral motion and 15 mm/year of right-lateral motion.

Key words. Crustal deformation · triangulation · GPS

1 Introduction

As the southwest boundary of the south China block, the Red River fault plays an important role in the tectonics of Asia (Molnar and Tapponnier 1975; Tapponnier et al. 1982, 1990; Armijo et al. 1989). Over 900 km long, it accommodated 700 ± 200 km of left-lateral offset prior to the end of the Miocene (5 Ma) (Lacassin et al. 1993; Leloup et al. 1995). Since then, the fault appears to have changed sense, becoming right-
lateral (Leloup et al. 1995). Although its trace is quite prominent in optical satellite images (Lacassin et al. 1994; Replumaz and Lacassin 1997), its present-day activity has not been precisely quantified. In its northwestern part, in Yunnan, China, the fault system includes two major strands in the Gasa valley (Leloup et al. 1995). One follows the base of the Ailao Shan (Mountains) while the other (“mid-valley”) strand crosses the valley floor. Here, Allen et al. (1984) estimate 3–7 mm/year of right-lateral slip, based on offset stream drainages and tenuous assumptions on their rate of incision. Trenching on the “mid-valley” strand leads to a most likely value of 2 mm/year and a possible range of 1–4 mm/year for the slip rate across the entire fault, using 14C dating (Weldon et al. 1994). This measurement probably represents a lower bound for the total slip rate because the fault shows several traces in the pull-apart basin surrounding the trenching site.

At the continental scale, a kinematic quasi-rigid block model designed to minimize elastic strain energy predicts that the south China block moves 10 ± 5 mm/year at N110°E with respect to its southern neighbor Sundaland (Peltzer and Saucier 1996). This relative velocity implies 8.9 ± 4.5 mm/year of right-lateral strike-slip and 4.6 ± 2.3 mm/year of extension on the Vietnamese section of the Red River fault where it strikes N43°W (Fig. 1). The extensional component is a direct consequence of the fault geometry. Since the fault does not trace a small circle about the pole of relative rotation between the two blocks it bounds, the slip vector on the fault must include an oblique component which varies along strike (Briais et al. 1993; Peltzer and Saucier 1996).

Only two geodetic measurements pertain, albeit indirectly, to the Red River fault. The relative velocity of Shanghai, China, with respect to sites in Europe on the Eurasian plate, estimated by VLBI is 8 ± 0.5 mm/year in the direction N117 ± 4°E (Molnar and Gipson 1996). Since the line between these two benchmarks crosses several other actively deforming zones, the Very Long Baseline Interferometry (VLBI) velocity represents at
best an upper bound for the slip rate of the Red River fault. Similarly, the relative velocity of benchmarks in Vietnam, Cam Pha (our station code CAM1) and Non Nuoc (NON4, near Da Nang), is $7.3 \pm 3.1$ mm/year at N161 ± 23°E based on Global Positioning System (GPS) measurements in 1994 and 1996 on the GEODYSSEA network (Walpersdorf 1997). The same author uses her geodetic velocities to estimate the rate of relative motion between two rigid plates: south China and Sundaland. The results of this model imply 13 mm/year right-lateral motion plus 12 mm/year of compression in the delta of the Red River, but uncertainties for these surprisingly rapid rates are not provided. Again, the long distance between the benchmarks prevents us from attributing all of this motion to the Red River fault alone.

The Red River fault shows relatively little instrumental seismicity. No earthquake with magnitude larger than 5.5 can be attributed to southern end of the fault in Vietnam between 1903 and 1990 (Fig. 1). Of course, this interval is considerably shorter than the recurrence time of a large earthquake, estimated to be 5000 to 7000 years (Weldon et al. 1994).

Clearly, the available data do not suffice to measure the present-day activity of the Red River fault system. In this

Fig. 1. Earthquake epicenters (open circles) of north Vietnam with magnitude $M > 1.0$ between 1903 and 1990 with several earthquake focal mechanisms based on “Geodynamic Seismicity of Vietnam”, Hanoi Branch – Institute of Oceanography, NCNST, Hanoi, Vietnam, 1994 (in Vietnamese). Heavy lines Fault traces from Lacassin et al. (1994). Rectangle Delimits the study area shown in Fig. 2. Open triangle CAM1 station, one of two points in the GEODYSSEA network (Walpersdorf 1997). Thin lines Rivers; dashed lines international borders

Fig. 2. Geodetic network with triangulation points (solid triangles), new GPS stations (open triangles), GEODYSSEA stations (solid triangles in inset map), provincial capital cities (squares), faults (heavy lines), and rivers (thin lines)
paper, we consider geodetic measurements in a fine-scale network spanning the fault zone over three decades. Specifically, the geodetic signature should distinguish between the following three competing hypotheses.

1. The fault is dead. Deformation in this area ceased sometime after the end of the Miocene (5 Ma).
2. The fault is active, but currently locked. In other words, the present day falls in an interseismic interval. The fault zone is accumulating strain as elastic potential energy to be released in a future earthquake.
3. The fault is actively releasing tectonic strain aseismically, presumably as creep, as documented in short (<100 km) segments of the San Andreas (Savage and Burford 1970) and Philippine (Duquesnoy et al. 1994) faults.

Fig. 3a–f. Measured angles $\alpha$ as a function of time, shown after subtracting their mean value $\alpha_0$. Min, Max give the minimum and maximum values of $\alpha - \alpha_0$ in $\mu$rad. The error bars represent 1 SD on either side of the plotted angle. The dashed line is the “best fitting” line. The solid line shows the behavior predicted by $\gamma_1$ and $\gamma_2$. Nine angles are excluded from the data set: MEN0-NGD0-NNS0, CDU0-MEN0-NLA9, VUA0-CHU0-NNA9, and the six angles involving station DAU0.
2 Data and precision

Our geodetic network in the study region consists of 20 stations, of which 12 are old triangulation points and 8 are new GPS benchmarks (Duong et al. 1994). In addition, we occupied two points in Vietnam of the continental-scale GEODYSSEA network described by Walpersdorf (1997) at Cam Pha and Non Nuoc (near Da Nang). The 12 triangulation and 8 new points span the Red River fault system in northern Vietnam. The network surrounds the Thac Ba reservoir and covers the provinces of Yen Bai, Tuyen Quang, Vinh Phuc, Phu Tho, and Bac Can (Fig. 2). Lacassin et al. (1994) have mapped three strands of the fault system using satellite images and field observations. From southwest to northeast, they are the Song Hong, Song Chay, and Tam Dao faults.

In 1963, during installation of the triangulation network for northern Vietnam, the 12 triangulation points were occupied with theodolites by the Geodetic Survey of Vietnam with the help of Chinese experts according to...
first- and second-order specifications. For this campaign, the data available to us are abstracted direction lists, that is, average values after "station adjustment" of 6 to 12 pointings.

In 1983 the same 12 triangulation points were measured a second time with theodolites according to first- and second-order specifications as part of the National Project on Recent Crustal Movements of the Red River delta (1981–1985). For this campaign, we have recovered the raw data for tie correction and deflection of the vertical. As for the 1963 survey, we have no data on atmospheric refraction. This time, four distances, averaging 13 km in length, were measured by trilateration with an average precision of ±23 cm or 18 ppm. Because of this poor precision, we exclude these distances from our data set.

In order to assess the precision of the 1963 and 1983 triangulation measurements, we can employ two standard, but indirect approaches. First, we calculate mis-closure in triangular subnetworks where all three angles...
were observed, according to Ferrero's formula (Bomford 1980). Taking the 1963 and 1983 surveys together, we find the Ferrero misclosure to vary from a minimum of 0.02 arcsec to a maximum of 0.7 arcsec, and average 0.43 arcsec of arc. Secondly, the station adjustments (Bomford 1980) for the 1983 survey show that the standard deviation of a direction to varies between a minimum of 0.04 arcsec and a maximum of 0.68 arcsec, and averages 0.35 arcsec. Accordingly, we assign a value of 0.7 arcsec to the standard deviation (a priori uncertainty) of a single datum in our estimation procedure, in accord with the first-order specification.

GPS signals were recorded on all stations of our network from 22 October to 1 November 1994 using seven Ashtech receivers in an occupation strategy designed to maximize the network's sensitivity to the gradient of the displacement field generated by strain on the fault system.

We analyzed GPS observations using GAMIT software (King and Bock 1995) for the single-session solu-
tions and GLOBK software (Herring 1995) to combine them according to standard procedures (Feigl et al. 1993), holding fixed the satellite orbital trajectories estimated by CODE (Beutler et al. 1994; Rothacher et al. 1996). We constrain the coordinates of station IISC (Bangalore, India) to its conventional ITRF94 coordinates (Boucher et al. 1996). The uncertainties range from 1 to 8 mm for the horizontal components, and from 8 to 114 mm for the vertical component as measured by the weighted root-mean-square (RMS) scatter. For the length, this precision depends on the distance between benchmarks as

$$
\sigma_{\text{length}} = \sqrt{a^2 + (bL)^2}
$$

(1)

where $a = 3.2 \text{ mm}$ and $b = 0.85 \times 10^{-6}$ for our results, and $L$ is the distance between benchmarks.
To adjust GPS measurements, we reduce them to direction lists on the ellipsoid almost as if they had been observed by theodolite. These we call “GPS ellipsoidal directions”. Propagating errors through Eq. (1), we find the standard error of the mean for such a direction to be 0.2 arcsec.

The overall scaling factor for the standard deviations, as measured by the postfit normalized rms, is 0.68, 0.73, and 0.085 for the 1963, 1983, and 1994 adjustments, respectively. For the three-epoch adjustment, the value is 0.64. All four values satisfy the $\chi^2$ test for the variance of unit weight (Vanicek and Krakiwsky 1986), validating our choice of data uncertainties. Consequently, we can say that there is no blunder in the triangulation measurements of 1963 and 1983. Furthermore, they and the “GPS ellipsoidal directions” are compatible.
3 Parameterization

From repeated geodetic measurements we can detect motion or estimate deformation parameters for a study area (Frank 1966; Prescott 1976; Bibby 1982; Feigl et al. 1990). Using the notation of Feigl et al. (1990) we can write the relative horizontal position (with respect to the spatial origin) of the \( m \)th station at time \( t_i \) as

\[
\Delta x_m = \Delta x_0 + (t_i - t_0)L_1 \Delta \xi_m
\]

where \( L \) is the gradient of horizontal velocity (Malvern 1969) and \( \xi_0 \) is the preliminary value of coordinate of the \( m \)th station at time \( t_0 \). The components of \( L \) lead directly to the two engineering shear rates \( \gamma_1 \) and \( \gamma_2 \), the parameters we will interpret in terms of fault motion.

To define these parameters, we follow Jaeger and Cook (1979) and Snay (1986). Thus, \( \gamma_1 \) measures the rate of change of a right angle between a ray pointed NW and one pointed NE. Similarly, \( \gamma_2 \) corresponds to the rate of change of a right angle between a ray pointed E and one pointed S.

Neither \( \gamma_1 \) or \( \gamma_2 \) can distinguish between so-called pure and simple shear. For example, we expect \( \gamma_1 > 0 \) for a right-lateral strike-slip fault striking NW, such as the Red River fault. For a visual interpretation of the other cases, see Fig. 5 of Feigl et al. (1990).

We will also use the maximum dextral shear rate, \( \gamma_{\text{max}} \), defined as

\[
\gamma_{\text{max}} = \sqrt{\gamma_1^2 + \gamma_2^2}
\]
Fig. 6. Total (maximum) shear rate estimates over Delaunay triangles. Crosses include the centroid of a triangle and the origin of no deformation. Error ellipses represent 95% confidence intervals. Squares indicate the same cities as labeled in Fig. 2.

Fig. 7. Distribution of the $\chi^2$ statistic for the residual (observed minus calculated) values of the 20 shear strain rates $\dot{\gamma}_1$ and $\dot{\gamma}_2$ as a function of two-dimensional model parameter space of locking depth $D$ (in km) and the rate of left-lateral slip $U_1$ (in mm/year). The shaded area shows the region of 95% confidence for which $\chi^2 = 16.6$. The most likely values fall inside the innermost contour where $\chi^2 = 11.0$ and the level of confidence is 23%.
The benchmark at YEN may have been disturbed between measurements by a local farmer. Stations DAU, NLA, and NNA were measured only twice.

As an additional quality control on the measured angles, we plot their rate of change in Fig. 4. Following Snay (1986), we write the rate of angular change normalized by $\sin x$ as

$$\left(\Delta x_i / \Delta t_i \right) \csc x_i = \gamma \sin \left(\psi - \theta_i \right)$$

where $x_i$ is the $i$th measured angle, $\psi$ is the azimuth of $\gamma$ and $\theta_i$ is the azimuth which bisects the angle $x_i$. This expression corrects a minor error in Snay (1986). Such a plot highlights the “outlier” measurements excluded from the three-epoch inversion.

4 Estimation strategy

To estimate deformation parameters, we use the network adjustment software developed by Danan Dong (Dong 1993; Dong et al. 1998). This software has been applied to similar data sets in California (Bawden et al. 1997) and France (Ferhat et al. 1998).

Our data suffice to determine only the rates of horizontal angular shear $\gamma_1$ and $\gamma_2$ (Bibby 1982; Feigl et al. 1990). In other words, the rates of dilatation and rotation are undetermined. Similarly, without repeated leveling data, we must assume no vertical motion by fixing the elevation of each site to its GPS-derived value.

For clarity, we divide the network into triangular subnetworks, forming a Delaunay triangulation (Gold 1975; Watson 1982). Within each triangle, we estimate the angular shear rate parameters $\gamma_1$ and $\gamma_2$, which we assume to be constant in time.

To evaluate the sensitivity of the estimated strain rates to various corrections to the data set, we perform a suite of network adjustments, as follows:

1. Combination of direction lists from 1963 and 1983 with the full covariance matrix for the 1994 GPS solution.
3. Combination of unreduced direction list with tie corrections from 1983.
4. Combination of reduced direction list without tie corrections from 1983.
5. With a correction for deflection of the vertical, assumed constant in time.
6. Without correction for deflection of the vertical.
7. With an artificial 10-m perturbation in the ellipsoidal height of a single station.

None of these perturbations alters the estimated values of $\gamma_1$ and $\gamma_2$ by more than one third of their uncertainties. We therefore conclude that they are fairly robust and use three direction lists (option 2) without any correction for deflection of the vertical (option 6) as input data for network adjustment.

Since the adjustment software parameterizes deformation in terms of station velocities, we must decide if and how to regularize the solution. There exist at least four options, as follows:

1. Free network, i.e. no constraints.
2. Minimum constraints, i.e. two fixed stations.
3. Inner coordinate solution (Segall and Matthews 1988).

Once again, the estimated values of $\gamma_1$ and $\gamma_2$ do not change by more than one third of their uncertainties between the estimation strategies. This is to be expected, since the shear strain rates are invariant to changes in network scale and orientation, the same parameters which regularization strategies 2, 3, and 4 constrain. Henceforth, the “free-network” solution (regularization 1) will form the basis of our geophysical interpretation.

Results

The average strain rates estimated from the three-epoch 1963–1983–1994 data set for the whole network are $\hat{\gamma}_1 = -0.019 \pm 0.055 \mu$rad/year and $\hat{\gamma}_2 = -0.094 \pm 0.060 \mu$rad/year. Considering subnetworks, we estimate the shear strain rates $\gamma_1$ and $\gamma_2$ in ten Delaunay triangles as a function of distance from the fault (Fig. 5). None of them are distinguishable from zero (no deformation) with 95% confidence. The measurements are not precise enough to detect a statistically significant geodetic signal from movement on the fault.

Figure 6 shows the same solution in terms of the maximum strain rate $\gamma_{\text{max}}$ and its azimuth $\psi$ on a map with the Delaunay triangulation.

Nonetheless, we can interpret the observed strain rates in terms of the fault’s activity. For example, the $\gamma_1$ shear strain rate is positive in seven of the ten triangles, a result which is compatible with dextral simple shear on the NW-striking Red River fault system. Similarly, the azimuth $\psi$ of maximum shear is parallel to the NW–SE trend of the fault, particularly in the three triangles near the Song Hong fault strand (Fig. 6). We interpret these results as interseismic deformation because no earthquake with magnitude larger than 5 has occurred within the geodetic network over the three decades spanned by the geodetic measurements (1963–1994).

The results for $\gamma_2$ are more challenging to interpret. In terms of “pure” shear oriented NW–SE (perpendicular to the fault trace), we can interpret a positive value of $\gamma_2$ as extension (indicative of normal faulting) and a negative value as compression (thrust faulting and/or folding). Both mechanisms are capable of producing topographic relief, as observed between the Song Chay and Tam Dao fault strands (near NLA at 0 km in the profile of Fig. 5). In this area, two of the four triangles show positive values of $\gamma_2$. Consequently, we are unable to resolve the debate between fault-normal extension, as suggested by the triangular-faceted geomorphology of the Tam Dao fault above Tuyen Quang (Lacassin, pers. comm. 1994) and fault-normal compression, as indicated
by the two-epoch GPS results between the far-field GEODYSSEA sites NON and CAM (Walpersdorf 1997).

To further the interpretation, we apply a simple elastic dislocation model (Okada 1985; Feigl and Duprè 1996). Given the fault geometry, this model calculates the deformation field at the Earth's surface. We consider the special case of a vertical strike-slip fault locked at depth, as for the San Andreas fault in California (Savage 1990). To fit the observations, we vary two parameters in the fault model: the locking depth $D$ (in km) and the rate of left-lateral slip $U_1$ (in mm/year). We evaluate the goodness of fit by calculating the $\chi^2$ statistic for the residual (observed minus calculated) values of the 20 shear strain rates $\gamma_1$ and $\gamma_2$. A grid search over a reasonable portion of this two-dimensional parameter space shows that the optimal solution is not unique (Fig. 7). Indeed, the region of 95% confidence is too large to provide much new, useful information on the activity of the fault.

We can, however, limit the extent of the parameter space with external information on the locking depth of the fault. We can exclude small values, say $D < 5$ km, because they imply a fault creeping near the surface, which has not been observed in concrete structures crossing the fault trace. Similarly, we can exclude large values, say $D > 20$ km, because most of the earthquakes in the study area have hypocentral depths around 15 km (Fig. 1). Even if these depths are poorly determined, it seems unlikely that the seismogenic layer (which we mimic as the locked portion of the fault) is thicker than 20 km. By limiting our attention to the portion of the parameter space where the locking depth $D$ is between 5 and 20 km, the most likely values for the deep slip rate $U_1$ are between 1 and 5 mm/year of right-lateral motion. These values fall within the contour for 23% confidence. At 95% confidence, the slip rate should fall between 7 mm/year of left-lateral motion and 15 mm/year of right-lateral motion.

6 Conclusion

We have used a time series of geodetic observations at three distinct epochs over 31 years in a network spanning an active fault. The imprecision of the early triangulation measurements limits our ability to make hard conclusions. At the level of 95% confidence, we detect no significant deformation in the network. Nonetheless, the estimated rates of shear strain rate favor the following points in a geophysical interpretation.

1. The Red River Fault system is most likely to be active in the present day as a right-lateral strike-slip fault. This result is consistent with a change in the sense of the fault slip sometime after 5 Ma ago, as most recently argued by Leloup et al. (1995).

2. The amount of slip at depth, below a currently locked seismogenic layer, is likely to be between 1 and 5 mm/year. In the absence of any aseismic “creeping” deformation, this rate should correspond to the “long-term” Plio-Quaternary slip rate for the Red River fault system in northern Vietnam, in approximate agreement with an independent estimate of the order of 5 mm/year based on a geomorphologic analysis of offsets in the drainage system by the same fault system in Yunnan, south China (Replumaz and Lacassin 1977).

3. The geodetic data are not precise enough to resolve any motion perpendicular to the fault to within about 0.2 μrad/year. The question of whether the fault system presently has a component of extensive or compressive motion remains open.

A second GPS survey before the year 2000, repeating the 1994 campaign, will decrease the uncertainty on the rates of deformation. It will also yield the vector velocity field, rather than just the rates of angular shear strain.

Acknowledgments. The authors are grateful to Professors Paul Tapponnier and Nguyen Trong Yem for inspiring this work. They thank Danan Dong for supporting his adjustment software and patiently answering many questions. Nguyen Hong Phuong of the Seismological Laboratory of Hanoi Branch – Institute of Oceanography, NCNST of Vietnam generously provided the earthquake catalogue. Robin Lacassin and Alexis Rigo commented helpfully on the manuscript and Andrea Walpersdorf kindly provided her results in advance of publication. Gilles Peltzer contributed critical insights to the field reconnaissance. The authors thank their colleagues from Toulouse and Hanoi for stalwart assistance in the field: Doan Vanuyen, Erik Doerrlinger, Do Minh Kien, Gilbert Ferhat, Pierre Genthon, Hoang Quang Vinh, Marc Monnereau, Ngo Quoc Dung, Nguyen Quang Xuan, Nguyen Viet Ninh, Mai Thanh Tan, Pham Tich Xuan, Phan Trong Trinh, Matthieu Syllvander, Tran Canh, Tran Dinh To, and Tran Van Doan. The triangulation data were collected from the Center of Information and Documentation of Geodetic Survey of Vietnam. All figures were produced with the public-domain GMT software (Wessel and Smith, 1991). This study was supported by a fellowship from the French Ministry of Foreign Affairs and a grant from CNRS/INSU Programme Tectoscope–Positionnement.

References


Feigl KL, King RW, Jordan TH (1990) Geodetic measurement of tectonic deformation in the Santa Maria fold and thrust belt, California. J. Geophys Res. 95: 2679–2699
Gold CM (1975) Automated contour mapping using triangular element data structures and an interpolant over each irregular domain. Comput Graph 11: 170–175